

## Plucked from the Sea?

by Peter Engberg and Tad Fitch

### ***Titanic Research***

Sunday 11 July 1999

#### **Survivors' Claims Reconsidered**

Survivors who claimed to having been in contact with the water.

Name	Comments
<b>First Class survivors:</b>	
Barkworth, Mr Algernon Henry Wilson	Barkworth claimed To have been rescued on Collapsible B. His claim is substantiated by Colonel Gracie.
Bradley, Mr George {"Mr George Arthur Brayton"} (George Andrew Brereton)	Bradley Claimed: a) in one interview that he was picked up by a passing boat. b) in other interviews that he simply entered one of the first boats. <i>Titanic</i> Historian George Behe suggested in 1982 that Bradley was in Lifeboat 15.
Daly, Mr Peter Denis	Daly claimed a) to have been in the water on his own for six hours before one of the <i>Carpathia's</i> boats picked him up. b) that he was on the same collapsible boat as Messrs Gracie and Rheims. c) to have been pulled into Collapsible A by fellow First Class Passengers R.N. Williams, and George Alexander Lucien Rheims. Rheims and Gracie were in different boats. However George Rheims corroborates Daly's claim, mentioning him by name as having been in Collapsible A. in an interview in the April 20th, 1912 edition of the New York Herald. Also, in a private letter from George Rheims' to his wife written on April 19, 1912, he recalled "I had the pleasure to be able to save a poor man, father of nine children, who asked me to give him a picture of myself with a dedication fit for the King of England." The man described could have been Peter Daly, who was the father of 18 children, 8 or 9 of which were alive at the time the <i>Titanic</i> sank.
Daniel, Mr Robert Williams	Daniel made vague and contradicting stories about jumping overboard and a) being pulled into a passing boat b) being rescued aboard Collapsible B with Jack Thayer. Trimmer Patrick Dillon claimed to have seen Daniel leap from the stern of the ship just before the final plunge, but Daniel was almost certainly in boat 3, mentioned by name by one of the first class ladies in boat.
Gracie, Colonel Archibald IV Hoyt, Mr Frederick Maxfield	Collapsible B. No comment necessary The only person to be picked up by boat D, the story is corroborated by several witnesses in the boat, e g chief steward Hardy.
Rheims, Mr George Alexander Lucien	Rheims claimed to having been on boat A. This is corroborated by other witnesses who were in Collapsible A, and by Rheims' medical condition, as noted in his testimony and claim of damages in the 1913 Limitation of Liability Lawsuit against the White Star Line.

Romaine, Mr Charles Hallace {"Mr C. Rolmane"}	Made several conflicting statements concerning how he escaped the sinking liner. He probably left in lifeboat 9 with Bradley.
Silverthorne, Mr Spencer Victor	Claimed to having left into the sea in at least one interview, notwithstanding the fact that he actually left in lifeboat 5 (according to most of his interviews as well as according to Gracie).
Björnström-Steffansson, Mr Mauritz Håkan	Stated in at least one interview that he was on the overturned collapsible lifeboat with Colonel Gracie and others. He was certainly, however, in Collapsible D.
Thayer, Mr John Borland, jr.	Collapsible B. No comment necessary.
Williams, Mr Richard Norris II	Collapsible A. No comment necessary.

At least 12 first class survivors claimed to having been in contact with the water.

### Second Class survivors.

Beane, Mr Edward	Gave several interviews, where he claimed that he placed his wife in a boat, which was not full, then leapt overboard and was picked up by the same boat in which his wife was. Since only lifeboats 4, 14 and D ever picked up people in that way he described and those people are known by name, his story is not plausible at all; in other interviews, however, he would describe entering a starboard lifeboat with his wife (very likely Lifeboat 13).
Mellors, Mr William John	Mellors claimed he was rescued aboard one of the collapsibles, probably Collapsible B. However, this is somewhat unclear, because during his testimony in the 1915 Limitation of Liability Lawsuit against the White Star Line, Mellors testified under oath that he had been in an "unassembled collapsible raft" along with Mrs. Rosa Abbott. Mrs. Abbott is known to have been rescued in Collapsible A.
Portaluppi, Mr Emilio Ilario Giuseppe	Gave rather far-fetched interviews about his escape; it is by no means clear what lifeboat he refers to, and the descriptions are rather vague. He may have been the fourth person who was picked up by lifeboat 14 (if there indeed was a fourth person), but equally likely, he may just have made the story up, instead having entered one of the starboard aft boats, perhaps lifeboat 9.

Williams, Mr Charles Eugene Williams gave at least one interview in which he stated that he had leapt overboard and that he had been picked up by a passing lifeboat, and at least two others in which he claimed to have been rescued aboard Collapsible A, and B, respectively. In one interview, Williams stated that he simply boarded one of the last lifeboats to be lowered from the deck. This seems to be true, as Fifth Officer Lowe recognized Mr Williams as the second class passenger he had taken into lifeboat 14 as an extra rower.

In all, four second class gentlemen.

**Third Class survivors.**

Abbott, Mrs Stanton (Rosa Hunt)	Collapsible A. No comment necessary.
Abelseth, Mr Olaus Jørgensen	Collapsible A. No comment necessary.
Abraham, Mrs Joseph (Mary Sophie Halaut Easu)	Said she was picked up by a passing lifeboat. Her meaning is unclear.
Albimona, Mr Nassef Cassem	Claimed that he 'Swam for it'.
Cohen, Mr Gurshon "Gus"	Said Mrs Astor picked him up, i. e. indicating lifeboat 4. In reality, one of the ladies in lifeboat 12 mentioned him as the man who jumped into that boat as it was lowered away.
Daly, Mr Eugene Patrick	Daly claimed to have leapt overboard, and reached Collapsible B just before the ship sank. Julia Smyth in lifeboat 13 recognized a "young Irish lad" in her boat, but there is no evidence to suggest that this was Daly. Daly's own claims of his survival are borne out by his physical condition when taken aboard the <i>Carpathia</i> (he was unconscious from cold), by his claim of injuries filed in the 1913 Limitation of Liability Lawsuit against the White Star Line, and by his testimony under oath in the same hearings, during 1915.  In both The Evening World April 22, 1912, and The East Galway Democrat May 11, 1912 Daly claims to have reached and clung to "an upturned collapsible raft," an "upturned boat," "a boat which upset," etc., before later being pulled into a regular lifeboat (undoubtedly Lifeboat #4 or #12 which rescued the survivors aboard B in the morning).
Dorking, Mr Edward Arthur	Gave lengthy interviews, describing Collapsible B.
Duquemin, Mr Joseph	Said he was picked up by Collapsible D. However he was almost certainly in it when it was lowered away.
Hedman, Mr Oskar Arvid	Said in a few interviews that he 'swam for it', in others that he entered the last lifeboat (i e Lifeboat 15).
Jansson, Mr Carl Olof	Collapsible A, he and Mr Andersson/Wennerström corroborate each other's stories.
Jonsson, Mr Carl	Jonsson claimed in a few interviews to have been lashed to a door for six hours, or to have "swam about for hours" before being pulled

	into Collapsible A. There is nothing to support his claims, and according to an article in The Hartford Times, Jonsson boarded Lifeboat 15, which was lowered from the deck, with a group of Scandinavians.
Karlsson, Mr Einar Gervasius	Claimed that he 'Swam for it', but actually entered Lifeboat 13 with Mr Asplund without further ado.
Karun, Mr Franz	Said he swam with his daughter before they were picked up, but in other interviews he denied this and said he entered a lifeboat instead (very likely Lifeboat 15).
Lang, Mr Fang	Picked up by Officer Lowe in Lifeboat 14.
Lindqvist, Mr Eino William	Claimed that he swam to Collapsible B, when he in reality entered lifeboat 15 with sister and niece (Mrs and Miss Hirvonen), and Mr Abrahamsson.
Lulic, Mr Nikola	Claimed that he 'Swam for it' and was picked up by a passing boat. But he was probably with the Karuns in lifeboat 15.
Lundström, Mr Thure Edvin	Claimed that he 'Swam for it' and was picked up by a passing boat. He had first helped the Sandströms into lifeboat 13, which might indicate his presence in lifeboat 15.
Madsen, Mr Fridtjof Arne	Mr Madsen stated that he was picked up by lifeboat 13, which, in fact, picked up nobody from the sea. He must have been in the boat already when it was lowered away.
McCormack, Mr Thomas Joseph	McCormack said he tried to climb into a boat in which the Murphy sisters already were seated, but that a sailor hit him with an oar. In another interview, he claimed to have reached a collapsible boat. In reality, he almost certainly boarded lifeboat 16 from the deck with the Murphy sisters, and was never even in contact with the water.
Moss, Albert Johan	Said he swam to Collapsible B. His hands were badly frozen.
De Mulder, Mr Theodoor	Gave vague interviews about being picked up by some boat. Not true. He may well have been one of the 'Germans' in lifeboat 11 together with Julius Sap and Jan B Scheerlinck, whom he knew.
O'Keefe, Mr Patrick	Has been placed on Collapsible B. Truth unknown.
Olsson, Mr Oscar Wilhelm ("_ Johansson")	Collapsible A. He is mentioned as being in the boat by Mr Jansson.
Persson, Mr Ernst Ulrik	In a letter to his wife he describes swimming to an upturned boat. See the biography for further details.
Sap, Mr Julius	See Mr De Mulder.
Scheerlinckx, Mr Jean	See Mr De Mulder.
Sunderland, Mr Victor Francis	Described his presence on Collapsible B. Truth unknown.
Tenglin, Mr Gunnar Isidor	He would sometimes describe being on a waterfilled collapsible boat, other times he left in the next-to-last lifeboat (i e lifeboat 13).
Törnquist, Mr William Henry	Claimed that he 'Swam for it', but his story is very vague. Most likely boarded a starboard aft boat.
Vartanian, Mr David	Has been placed on Collapsible A; but most likely, he was in lifeboat 13 or 15.
Andersson, Mr August Edvard {"Wennerström"}	Collapsible A. See Mr Jansson.
Jalševac, Mr Ivan	In some interviews, he leapt overboard, in others he said those interviews were incorrect and that he in fact was with the Karuns in their lifeboat.
McCoy, Mr Bernard	Said his sisters pulled him into their boat. Very unlikely, he probably boarded with them.

**Crew survivors.**

Allen, Mr Ernest F.	Collapsible B.
Bride, Mr Harold Sydney	Collapsible B.
Brown, Mr Edward	Collapsible A.
Collins, Mr John	Collapsible B.
Cunningham, Mr Andrew	Picked up lifeboat 4.
Daniels, Mr Sidney Edward	Daniels claimed he was on Collapsible B, which is possibly true. After the disaster, he came down with a case of quinsy, and press reports suggest that he was one of the survivors taken to a hospital, probably St. Luke's, after the <i>Carpathia</i> reached New York.
Dillon, Mr Thomas Patrick	Picked up by lifeboat 4.
Fitzpatrick, Mr Charles William N.	Claimed he swam to Collapsible B. Truth unknown.
Hebb, Mr A.	Collapsible B.
Hemming, Mr Samuel Ernest	Swam to lifeboat 4.
Hurst, Mr Walter	Collapsible B.
Joughin, Mr Charles John	Collapsible B.
Judd, Mr Charles E.	Collapsible B.
Lightoller, Mr Charles Herbert	Collapsible B.
Lindsay, Mr William Charles	Collapsible B.
Lucas, Mr William (saloon steward)	Collapsible A.
Maynard, Mr Isaac	Collapsible B, according to Joughin.
McGann, Mr James	Collapsible B.
McIntyre, Mr William	McIntyre was likely on board Collapsible A or B. Details of his known accounts are too vague to determine which was the case.
O'Connor, Mr John	Collapsible B, according to Podesta and Nutbean.
Phillimore, Mr Harold Charles William	Picked up by lifeboat 14.
Pragnell, Mr George	Collapsible B.
Prentice, Mr Frank George	Picked up by lifeboat 4.
Scott, Mr Frederick	Picked up by lifeboat 4.
Senior, Mr Henry ("Harry")	Collapsible B.
Snow, Mr Eustace Philip	Has been placed on Collapsible B. Truth unknown.
Theissinger, Mr Alfred	Claimed to having swum for it. In reality, he was in lifeboat 11.
Thompson, Mr John	Collapsible A.
Weikman, Mr Augustus H.	Collapsible A.
White, Mr Alfred	Picked up by lifeboat 4.
Whiteley, Mr Thomas	Collapsible B.

At least 31 crewmen claimed to having been in the water.

In all, from 44 to 48 were actually saved from the water while about 79 passengers and crew have been found who said they had been in contact with the water. There are probably others whose accounts are yet to be discovered, as well. This figure stands in sharp contrast to the number actually saved from the water.

Lifeboat 4 picked up eight, two of whom died (not included in the list above); six survivors.

Lifeboat 14 picked up three or four people, one of whom died; there were two or three saved.

Collapsible A probably contained between 11 and 14 survivors but estimates vary so much that it is impossible to determine the exact number. R.N. Williams said 11, Scarrot and Lowe testified to 20 or so men and one lady, Carl Olof Jansson stated there was 12, Rheims said that there was 12 in the letter to his wife, and then said 14 in his 1913 testimony, Steward Brown said 14, then 12, Peter Daly said 13,

Wennerstrom said 11, etc., etc.

Collapsible B probably had between 25 and 35 people on board when boats 4 and 12 saved them however, eyewitness testimony varies so much that it is impossible to pin point the number. Steward Whiteley said that there were 30-35 aboard, Lightoller said there were about 30, mainly stokers and only three male passengers, but that three or so died during the night, Colonel Gracie says he was certain there were at least 30, Jack Thayer believed 28 men were aboard the boat, Barkworth gave conflicting figures, but estimated around 20-30, etc., etc.

Collapsible D picked up one passenger; Mr Hoyt.

There is no evidence that any of the other boats picked up swimmers.

---

Courtesy of Peter Engberg

© Encyclopedia Titanica ([www.encyclopedia-titanica.org](http://www.encyclopedia-titanica.org)) 1996-2011 and third parties (ref: #1499)  
URL : <http://www.encyclopedia-titanica.org/plucked-from-the-sea.html>

---

PDF edition provided for personal reference only.

